# IN THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT FOR THE DISTRICT OF PUERTO RICO

| INGENIA | ۱DOR | , LLC, |
|---------|------|--------|
|         |      |        |

Plaintiff,

v.

Civil Case No. 11-1840 (GAG)

ALFRESCO SOFTWARE, INC.;
BLACKBOARD, INC.; BRIDGELINE
DIGITAL, INC.; COMPULINK
MANAGEMENT CENTER, INC.; EMC
CORP.; HEWLETT-PACKARD CO.;
INFORMATICA CORP.; INTERWOVEN,
INC.; LEXMARK INTERNATIONAL, INC.;
MICROSOFT CORP.; NUXEO CORP.;
OBJECTIVE CORP. USA, INC.; ORACLE
CORP.; SAP AMERICA, INC.; SDL
TRIDION, INC.; and SPRINGCM, INC.,

Defendants.

### NOTICE OF SUPPLEMENTAL AUTHORITY

#### TO THE HONORABLE COURT:

COMES NOW co-defendant, EMC Corporation ("EMC"), and through its undersigned counsel, respectfully requests that the Court take notice of the following:

1. Yesterday, in further support of its motion seeking dismissal due to improper joinder or, in the alternative, for transfer (Docket No. 99), EMC filed two replies (Docket Nos. 183, 184).

- 2. Attached is a decision handed down last Friday by another United States District Court that discusses the joinder of multiple defendants to a patent infringement action. *See Automated Tracking Solutions, LLC v. Awarepoint Corp.*, Civil No. 2:ll-cv-424 (E.D. Va. Jan. 13, 2012) (granting motion to dismiss under Rule 21 for improper joinder for failure to meet the permissive joinder requirements under Rule 20).
- 3. The *Awarepoint* decision was not cited by EMC in yesterday's filings because it was not discovered until today.
- 4. EMC believes that the *Awarepoint* decision may serve as an additional persuasive authority for the Court to consider in its evaluation of EMC's pending motion to dismiss.
- 5. In the spirit of Fed. R. App. P. 28(j), therefore, EMC respectfully requests that this Honorable Court take notice of the *Awarepoint* decision.

WHEREFORE, EMC respectfully requests that this Honorable Court take notice of this supplemental persuasive authority.

I HEREBY CERTIFY that on this same date, the foregoing was electronically filed with the Clerk of the Court using the CM/ECF System, which will send notification of such filing to all attorneys of record.

RESPECTFULLY SUBMITTED in San Juan, Puerto Rico, this 18th day of January, 2012.

#### O'NEILL & BORGES

s/Salvador J. Antonetti-Stutts Salvador J. Antonetti-Stutts USDC-PR No. 215002 santonetti@oneillborges.com Mauricio O. Muñiz-Luciano USDC-PR No. 220914 mmuniz@oneillborges.com

O'NEILL & BORGES American International Plaza 250 Muñoz Rivera Avenue, Suite 800 San Juan, Puerto Rico 00918-1813 Tel. 787-764-8181

Attorneys for Defendant EMC Corporation

## Of Counsel:

ROPES & GRAY LLP Jesse J. Jenner Khue V. Hoang Brandon H. Stroy ROPES & GRAY LLP 1211 Avenue of the Americas New York, NY 10036-8704 (212) 596-9000